



THE DEFINING MOMENTS OF BUSINESS SUCCESS AMONG WOMEN MICRO-ENTREPRENEURS: A LITERATURE REVIEW AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

Jonathan C Gano-an, Compostela Valley State College, Philippines

ABSTRACT

Empirical studies indicate that the unprecedented number of women who engaged in entrepreneurial endeavors is significantly increasing and their participation in entrepreneurship was fueled by their experiences, role at home, and societal norms. This paper defines the business success and illuminates its meaning from the perspective of women micro-entrepreneurs. A systematic literature review approach was employed in using pre-determined keywords. For the purpose of this study, these literatures are limited within the scope of women micro-entrepreneurship which are published in peer reviewed journals from 2001 to 2019. Findings of this literature review showed that women micro-entrepreneurs used subjective terms to define and interpret success instead of solely using quantitative criteria. From the selected readings, the definition of success has been refined and illuminated and expressed such in specific circumstance that translates to 'moments of success'. Among the moments that define their success are autonomy, personal contentment, enjoyment, being able to control destiny, survival during hard times, and the skills developed. These moments further have afforded them to attain empowerment allowing them to gain status in the society. Philosophically, most of these researches are considered within post-positivist and constructivist worldviews and it is suggested that future studies, in view of multiple realities and innovative approach, a pragmatist view may be considered.

Keywords: Women entrepreneurs, micro-entrepreneurship, success, entrepreneurship, literature review

Introduction

In entrepreneurship literature, the idea of business success has remained a debatable issue (Gorgievski, Ascalon, & Stephan, 2011). This is despite the indication that the success of micro businesses has been subjected to a great deal of study. For instance, the classic and the most traditional way of defining success is primarily based on financial earnings specifically profit and revenue generated and the number of employees that the business employ (Carter & Jones-Evans, 2006; Cardon & Patel, 2015). Nonetheless, there is no single agreement in the literature on what is really meant by the success among micro-businesses. Indeed, a myriad of viewpoints, ranging from mere survival to the attainment of certain percentage of performance existed in entrepreneurship literature. Very often, the terms success, survival, existence, and development are closely related with each other.

An extensive amount of researches in the field of entrepreneurship view the idea of success as the same with survival. To illustrate, Cader and Leatherman (2011) claimed that the longevity of the business existence and its ability to survive the involuntary cessation of its activities is an indication that it can achieve success. In consonance with Reijonen & Komppula (2010), they offered a short meaning in connection to survival by defining success as sustained business activities and the likelihood of failure to occur is lesser.

Researchers have also found that the basic approach to defining success is the use of non-financial measures such as fulfillment and the wealth acquired and then compute the difference between these criteria (Fisher, Maritz, & Lobo, 2014; Gorgievski, Ascalon, & Stephan, 2011; Wach, Stephan, & Gorgievski, 2016). On the other hand, in view of non-monetary definition of success, an entrepreneur might consider it as a form of personal fulfillment which may connote as attainment of personal desires, being at par with the job performed, or having a distinct degree of creativity and intellectual capacity over the others (Kirkwood, 2016). Another dominant factor which may influence the definition of the “success” is the social status of the entrepreneur in the society (Fauchart & Gruber, 2011).

The used of some definite financial criteria in defining success neglects the opportunity of women micro entrepreneurs to be recognized as one of the pillars of economic success and offers an impartial understanding on the concepts relating to micro-businesses owned and managed by women entrepreneurs.

Another point is that using financial metrics to define success does not define the real value that the women micro-entrepreneur got from the venture, considering the size and capital structure. An analysis on how women defined success (other than financial indicators) is necessary as this will help policymakers in determining the measures to support and maintain economic empowerment and independence among them. In this paper, I would like to illuminate the non-numerical basis and delve more on the subjective definition of success among women entrepreneurs, rather than on financial indicators.

Method

For a productive and expedited review, the researcher used a systematic literature review concerning the defining moments of success among micro entrepreneurs. A systematic literature review is a kind of research where it tries to address wide range of questions (Baumeister & Leary, 1997). The primary purpose of literature reviews is to address problems

by critically determining and evaluating the issue and integrate findings from high quality studies. Systematic reviews aim to address problems by identifying, critically evaluating and integrating the findings of all relevant, high-quality individual studies addressing one or more research question (Siddaway, 2014). It is also argued that systematic reviews offer practical inferences.

The initial review begins with the following keywords: “Success”, “Women Entrepreneurs”, “Micro entrepreneurs”, and “Definition”. Because of the limited number of numbers of studies generated, the researcher expanded the search to gather more relevant studies. Boolean search operators were used to broaden the search and truncation symbol was considered as well. To avoid replication, each PDF was sorted according to the content stated in the abstract. The researcher considered the publications from 2003- 2019.

Table 1. Search String Used

Major Search Subjects	Keywords
Success	success* OR successful* OR business success* OR enterprise success* OR successful venture* OR entrepreneurial success* OR achievement* OR attainment*
Micro entrepreneurs	micro-entrepreneur* OR *small scale entrepreneur* OR micro businesswoman* OR female entrepreneur* OR small business owner* OR auto entrepreneur* OR business owner
Definition	define* OR measure* OR describe* OR definition* OR meaning* OR defined* OR mean
Women Entrepreneurs	women owners* OR female sellers* OR women micro-entrepreneur* OR female entrepreneurship* OR female entrepreneur*

Women Micro-Entrepreneurs

Mboko and Smith-Hunter (2010) clarified that women entrepreneurs have challenged the societal notion that they are weak, pure housewives, and not capable of managing an enterprise. Actually, women entrepreneurs have dealt with this kind of scenario by proving their worth and value in economic and social arena and fought their way through. The entrepreneurial characteristics of women entrepreneurs, their passion to engage in business is influenced by confidence, courage and strong will power. Also, in pursuing their dreams, they fought shortcomings or obstacles by their innate strength and power (Xavier, Ahmad, Nor, & Yusof, 2012).

According to World Bank (2014) women accounted about 40 percent of the total workforce and throughout the developing nations, roughly 40 percent of small and medium enterprises (SME's) and micro enterprises are owned and managed by female entrepreneurs. Though these figures might be convincing, the fact is that they concentrate in small profit generating enterprises and it usually gets the lowest or narrow opportunity. To equalize their maternal roles while managing their ventures, their businesses are usually home-based as mothers are also nursing their infants (World Bank, 2014).

In the current economic and development agenda of the developing economies, women entrepreneurship development is seen as an essential issue to deal with. Female entrepreneurs are individuals who were single or with partners who establish a new venture or a successor of an existing one who have the courage to take the social, financial, and managerial risks associated with the endeavor (Parvin, Rahman, & Jia, 2012). Through entrepreneurship, women's ability to plan, organize and carry out decisions has increased in their personal life and even in the community where they belong to. As such, it gives them the empowerment and motivation in various aspects such as economic, social, and cultural (Nawaz, 2009). On the same note, Pulubuhu, Sutinah, Wati, & Adhawaty (2019) argued that women need a certain degree of empowerment in order to help them formulate good business decisions.

The large concentration of women micro-entrepreneurs can be found in less developed and developing worlds. Their presence somehow helped ease the supply chain in these states as most of the consumers are situated in slums, rural communities, informal villages, and sidewalks. Most of the women micro-entrepreneurs operate at the comfort of their homes with their stores attached to their living rooms, small extension or foldable tables & tents in streets, alleys and walkways, and roadside stands. Retail businesses share the biggest chunk of women's micro-business and their retail store usually sells convenience goods, personal care products, food, and even electronic loads. In general, these women performed dual functions or roles (doing maternal duties and performing entrepreneurial activities).

Women's Motivation to Engage in Business

Singh (2012) showed that women entrepreneurs may encounter problems in their entrepreneurial journey and these challenges are going problematic due to the twofold responsibilities of women at home, however, it is worth considering that these women micro-entrepreneurs fearlessly faced the risks and challenges using the available resources in their environment (International Labor Organization, 2015). Amongst these, Nieman and Nieuwenhuizen (2009) also argued that women are best opportunity seekers, whose ventures are continuously growing, and productively gather resources to support her goals. Women are also capable of starting or creating a high profit generating business activity as they have the power to envision, have a sound mind setting and skillful in scaling up their enterprise (Timmons & Spinelli, 2009).

Rather than entertaining failures, women entrepreneurs found an inspiration on their experience and turn them into valuable characteristics. Women are becoming qualified to manage an enterprise as they are also quite satisfied with their personal attributes, social status, and confidence level (Deng, Wang, & Alon, 2010). For instance, Hossain, Naser, Zaman, and Nuseibeh (2009) said that self-determination is the pedestal of which entrepreneurial behavior stands. A person who consistently manifested a self-determined behavior is tagged as a determined individual which is a natural character (Shogren, Wehmeyer, Palmer, Forber-Pratt, Little, & Lopez, 2015).

Under this perspective, a person's behavioral expression is exhibited by the degree of confidence in performing entrepreneurial activities (Deci & Ryan, 2011). Lakshmi and Rangarajan (2012) also suggested that business owners who established new ventures are usually strong, willing to work hard, and determined individuals and following Dhillon's (2017) study, he explained that more women are turning to entrepreneurship because of some traumatic circumstances and for economic reasons as well.

Defining Success

Just like failures, business researchers claimed that the success of an enterprise is driven and influenced by internal and external elements (Penrose & Penrose, 2009). Ayyagari, Demirguc-Kunt, and Maksimovic (2011) suggested that it is imperative to intensify the efforts exerted in both internal and external environments for micro enterprises to grow. Within the perspective of success, literatures usually laid factors about the internal and external environments of the enterprise. Sadi and Al-Ghazali (2012) claimed that self-achievement appeared to be the most important motivating factor among women. Alam, Jani, and Omar (2011) also suggested that women in developing nations were primarily motivated by achievement to do business and Ettl and Welter (2012) asserted that business success can be seen in the degree of personal achievement.

Weber (2014) noted that success is not solely determined by a common indicator rather it depended on the subjective judgements of the women entrepreneur. For Lussier, Sonfield, Corman, and McKinney (2001) business success emanates from the entrepreneur who screens and understands key components of business and supervise the activities accordingly. Rauch and Frese (2007) also pointed out that business success is directly linked to economic independence, proactive personality, and the ability to handle unfavorable situations and risks.

Lai, Nathan, Tan, and Chan (2010) relates entrepreneurial success with personal factors such as being flexible, possessing initiative and self-confidence, having a robust spirit, and being a competitive person. Defining success among micro entrepreneurs is matter of personal opinion and perceptions though they were aware with the fact that traditional businessmen define success using financial metrics. Significantly, Ayobami and Olakitan (2011) recognized the fact that defining entrepreneurial success can be viewed in multiple perspectives but there is not much higher than the person achieving it. Thus, the best definition comes the personal judgement of the entrepreneur.

Authors characterized these factors as drivers of success for micro businesses: reputation, societal factors, comfort, economic situation and educational attainment. Price, Rae, and Cini (2013) recognized current market state, the character, and confidence of the owner who gamble his personal assets to invest in business are the best ways to assess success. In the same way, Saleem (2017) noted that there are multiple determinants of business success. In most cases, sales volume, profit and the total assets acquired are the factors being considered. The best suitable way to describe success among entrepreneurs rest on output and economic indicators (Walker & Brown, 2008). However, if the basis for defining success purely lies by on the financial performance, many of the women micro entrepreneurs may not be considered successful because of the size of their venture and the slow pace of entrepreneurial growth (Alam, Jani, & Omar, 2011).

Personality Traits

Personality employs a direct influence on business success (Schneider, 2017). In fact, the relevance and significance of the personality for entrepreneurial success has been indicated by several studies (Makhbul & Hasun, 2011; Peris Bonet, Rueda Armengot, & Galindo Martín, 2011; Rauch & Frese, 2007).

Women have achieved a considerable amount of success in running businesses and their personality characteristics and personal knowledge greatly helped them (Klyver & Grant, 2010). Simultaneously, Jayawarna, Rouse, and Kitching (2013) argued that the success of a particular business relies on the aims and artifice of the entrepreneur. While Gupta, Guha, and Krishnaswami (2013) contended that success is dependent on the entrepreneurs' leadership approach, combination of theoretical and practical knowledge, management skills, creativity, advancement, and risk taking factors.

One thing that Indian women considered that they are successful is because of being clever, motivated and strong business owners (Goyal & Parkash, 2011). Women acquired wealth through competence, diligence, and hard work (Attar & Jawale, 2012). Every women entrepreneur is brave enough to explore market opportunities. Entrepreneur's behavior and inspiration are considered to be vital for the success and survival of micro enterprises. Fahed-Sreih and Morin-Delerm (2012) established the idea that commitment to excellence is closely related to the success of the newly created business.

Perseverance (Lamine, Mian, & Fayolle, 2014) and self-efficacy (Lunenburg, 2011) are another important elements that help the women entrepreneurs to be successful as these help them sustain the high power and most importantly to overcome the difficulties in their business undertaking (Potgieter, 2012).

Strong locus of control is the most important characteristic among women entrepreneurs. They always believe that their future depends on the quality of their business decision and typically see their strong will power (Zhang & Bruning, 2011). Authors postulated that self-efficacy is used to materialize their visions and it is a powerful eye to recognize new market opportunities and products. In entrepreneurship, self-efficacy defines the owner's confidence and will that he can accomplish tasks and duties (Cassar & Friedman, 2009).

Hazlina Ahmad, Ramayah, Wilson, & Kummerow (2010) also emphasized the link of personal entrepreneurial competencies and business success. Factors that are important to business success are advancement, positivity, persistence, personal success and achievement, commitment, risk taking skills, networking, and decision making powers (Abdullah, Hamali, Rahman Deen, Saban, & Zainoren Abg Abdurahman, 2009).

The Power of Optimism

Among the professions in this world, women entrepreneurs belong to the most confident and optimistic type. But there is a question of why women entrepreneurs persist even when their income is extremely, the answer could be overconfidence and positivity (Benz, 2009). Optimism and confidence proved to help realize success of the enterprise. As such, there is an increasing necessity to help them build their self-confidence, allow them to look at life at a positive perspective as these are the foundations to achieve success in their entrepreneurial activities (Khalili, Qassas, & Barghouthi, 2018).

Based on the survey conducted by Storey (2011), it was found out that small and newly established enterprises' success can be best understood if entrepreneurial efforts are mixed with positivity. Scholarly discussions also showed that entrepreneurs have a high level of optimism and confidence (Hmieleski & Baron, 2009). Consistent to that, people who possess an overwhelming amount of optimism are assured to achieve successful results (Hmieleski & Baron, 2009). Therefore, optimism is an integral part of the entrepreneurial process and

ultimately, success (Adomako, Danso, Uddin, & Damoah, 2016). Other literatures also suggest that optimism motivated determination (Solberg Nes, Evans, & Segerstrom, 2009). The moderate level of positivity is good but an overwhelming level lowers the business performance and less probability of achieving success (Dawson, de Meza, Henley, & Arabsheibani, 2014).

Success and Faith

Women entrepreneurs are really devoting their entrepreneurial ventures to the Almighty Father. Din's (2007) findings claimed that faith entails confidence from the heart, spoken through one's tongue and seen in the person's actions. Counting further the studies about the elite entrepreneurs, Lindsay and Smith's (2010) finding showed that the growing number of entrepreneurs who associated their endeavors with their faith (Lambert III & Lambert, 2009) has indeed proven the relationship of faith and work. Accordingly, women believe that a constant communication with God through prayer help women entrepreneurs to be more determined, strong, and not to give up easily (Yusof, Hameed, Tahir, & Othman, 2018). Moreover, giving alms is another manifestation of their faith and Ghazali and Kamri (2017) pointed out that in order to have a good relationship with God, a person must show a strong and clean faith to God.

Similarly, American Entrepreneurs also found religion as a special plus factor in their business (Dougherty, Neubert, Griebel, & Park, 2013). Women basically rely on prayers when they are confronted with trials and difficulties and more women are turning their faith to God as they gain enough strength to stand against adverse business situations (Walker, 2009).

Women associate their success with their faith and strong devotion to God. In a study done by Griebel, Park, and Neubert (2014), they articulated that an entrepreneur's belief and trust in God have helped their entrepreneurial endeavors. Lindsay and Smith (2010) explained that faith influences the business decision of the evangelical elites. Miller and Ewest (2013) also found the place of faith in business as evidence by an increasing sum of entrepreneurs who started to incorporate their individual faith in their entrepreneurial activities, and proved that allowing faith to come is the best strategy to achieve balance between personal and work life (Russell, 2013).

Expanded Definition of Business Success

Women's entrepreneurial success is a complicated to define and authors (Fisher, Maritz, & Lobo, 2014) argued that it can be fully explained using numerical and economic terms. But then again, economic metrics do not entirely represent what entrepreneurs actually perceive as success (Wach, Stephan, & Gorgievsky, 2016). Most female entrepreneurs have an opportunity to become autonomous, improve themselves, protect their communities, and they have better chances to attain progress (Reavley & Lituchy, 2004; Srivastava, 2012). The subjective personal achievement depends on professional growth and the entrepreneur's non-financial goals (Dej, 2010). The intangible non-financial success indicators might include relationship, the societal influence, and personal accomplishment and growth.

Obtaining a single and substantial definition is as hard as quantifying success among women micro-entrepreneurs. To shed some light on this, I came across with the study of Ahmad and Seet (2006) on business success among small business owners in Malaysia and Australia. I expanded this indicator (non-financial) as I found it relevant in this study. Out from 8 non-

financial definitions of success, I chose to consider only 6 of them which I found to be more appropriate in my analysis.

Table 2. Subjective Definition of Business Success (*Expanding on Ahmad & Seet, 2006*)

Subjective definition	Related Studies/Author	So what it means to be successful?
Satisfaction	-Success is clearly manifested with subjective criteria such as self-fulfillment and satisfaction of an individual from his or her own career (Baruch, 2006).	Satisfaction under this category is multifaceted and broad; this might mean:
	-The definition of success has been incorporated with more personal or psychological aspects such as the ability to be independent and gain a sense of personal satisfaction (Reavley & Lituchy, 2008).	1. happiness derived through provision of products to their patrons
	- Sarkis, Naser, Mohammed, and Nuseibeh (2009) found out that achievement and self-fulfillment were important motivating factors that added satisfaction to women in successfully starting their businesses.	2. inner feeling of fulfillment in establishing their small venture
	-Ashraf and Qureshi (2010) contends that entrepreneur's satisfaction indicates success.	3. contentment of contributing to family income, allowing them to be more productive than being considered as a mere housewife
	-Entrepreneurial success is attributed to personal satisfaction (Powell & Eddleston, 2013).	4. meeting the desired entrepreneurial goals while performing maternal obligations
	-Success would mean fulfillment and personal satisfaction (Fisher, Maritz, & Lobo, 2014; Kirkwood, 2016)	5. pride of realizing their entrepreneurial spirit
	-Achievement/success is comprised of two factors, namely: managing own business that gives personal satisfaction and provided a sense of personal attainment (Matharu, 2016).	
	-Entrepreneur's satisfaction is among the business success dimensions of micro-firms (Razmus & Laguna, 2018).	

Control over own destiny	<p>-Entrepreneurs enjoy autonomy and they are primarily in control of their own destiny (Parker, 2004)</p> <p>-Women entrepreneur's success would mean having control with their destiny along with building good relationship with their clients (Chotkan, 2009).</p> <p>-The entrepreneur's desire to control their own destiny are among the factors that influence female entrepreneurship (Parvin, Rahman, & Jia, 2012).</p> <p>-Entrepreneurs are driven with the need to succeed and control their own destiny (Romelus, 2015).</p> <p>-Successful women entrepreneurs considered their entrepreneurial career as an option that can provide considerable control of one's own destiny (World Economic Forum, 2020).</p>	<p>Controlling one's destiny is impossible, but for women micro-entrepreneurs, they have a belief that their entrepreneurial endeavor, along with the artifice that were developed, may influence the pace and direction of business success and such success would mean:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. living with their dreams accordingly 2. the personal choice they made in the course of their entrepreneurial career (as influenced by their experience) has helped them shape their future options 3. the determination to shape their future as dictated by their intuitions and instincts.
Enjoy doing what one is doing	<p>-Success is defined as a person's satisfaction in what one is doing and being able to pay the personnel with a good salary (Chotkan, 2009).</p> <p>-For women entrepreneurs, engaging in an entrepreneurial activity is something they had enjoyed and found personally and professionally rewarding, delivering a sense of achievement and control over their career (McGowan, Redeker, Cooper, & Greenan, 2012).</p> <p>-About one third of small business owners describe themselves as doing something they enjoy (BMO Wealth Management, 2016)</p> <p>-Entrepreneurs claimed that they are doing things that they enjoy and of interest to them (Mustapha, 2016).</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. the personal reward of enjoying what they love to do 2. the time spent for their passion is such an incomparable amount of success 3. pursuing their personal interests 4. excitement and pleasure of working for their dreams 5. the moment where they were doubt-free of their venture

	<p>-Seeing women entrepreneurs succeed through their effort strengthens their conviction that they will be able to master comparable challenges they might meet on the path to entrepreneurial success (Schneider, 2017).</p> <p>-Success is when you see that people enjoying their work and that they have the excitement to come to work and work in the business every day (Solevik, Iakovleva, & Trifilova, 2019).</p>	
Having freedom	<p>-Sabrina (2007), As women become confident in the society, they gained freedom on deciding what matters to them. With this, the women are able to mobilize themselves towards economic empowerment.</p> <p>-Entrepreneurial roles may afford some women more freedom to pursue professional interests (Orser & Dyke, 2009)</p> <p>-Akhalwaya and Havenga (2012) stated that women continue to be in business because of personal freedom.</p> <p>-Entrepreneurs have greater autonomy, flexibility and independence, brought about by the fact that they are responsible for their decisions (Millan, Hessels, Thurik, & Aguado, 2013).</p> <p>-In a study of Minarcine and Shaw (2016), the entrepreneurs understood success as freedom of choice, to be the masters of their own destiny, and being happy.</p> <p>-Entrepreneurship is generally allows more freedom, which could contribute to greater life satisfaction by enabling people to balance work, home, and childcare demands through flexible working hours (Eib & Siegert, 2019).</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. enormous amount of independence that they gained from their entrepreneurial activity 2. the ability to earn by themselves rather than being dependent to their husband 3. the pride of making a single decision for their venture 4. having the sole authority to choose, determine, project, and govern their small venture 5. exercising flexibility in performing dual roles
	<p>-Matherly and Goldsmith (2006) recognized that creativity as</p>	<p>Women's entrepreneurial activity also allowed them to</p>

Improved skills and creativity	<p>entrepreneurial trait is positively linked with business success.</p> <p>-Taatila (2010) argued that successful entrepreneurs must be creative, risk-taker, and innovative in order to respond to the ever changing external environment.</p> <p>-Female entrepreneurs has proven that innovation is one of the critical characteristics to succeed (Lai, Nathan, Tan, & Chan, 2010).</p> <p>-According to Bakri and Mardziah (2012) women entrepreneurs are more creative especially in solving problems for the success of their business.</p> <p>Innovativeness has been said to be the core characteristic of an entrepreneur (Rieger, 2012) and entrepreneurs has been considered 'innovative' as result from their creativity and knowledge (LeBlanc, 2013).</p> <p>-In order for the entrepreneur to be successful, general business skills must be enhanced and practiced (Morris, Webb, Fu, & Singhal, 2013).</p>	<p>develop personal traits and attributes and this is how success has been considered:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. artifice when dealing with adverse situations 2. the talents which were developed and possessing risk-taking skills, confidence, and will power 3. the innovative and creative capacities that were developed 4. problem solving and general business skills
Survival business	<p>-An alternative definition of business success depends on how long an entrepreneur can survive and prevent uncontrolled withdrawal, making the business successful (Van Praag 2003).</p> <p>-Reijonen and Komppula (2010) posits that success means sustained business activities and the likelihood of failure to occur is lesser.</p> <p>-Business existence and longevity indicates success (Cader & Leatherman, 2011).</p> <p>-The meaning of success is equivalent to continued business operations (Rashid, Ngah, Mohamed, & Mansor, 2015).</p>	<p>Considering the size of their venture, women micro-entrepreneurs credited their success to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. continuous business operation 2. the ability to endure and subsist during hard times 3. having the tenacity and being resolute in counteracting with difficulties in their entrepreneurial journey

-Justo, DeTienne, and Sieger (2015) have equated firm survival with entrepreneurial success.

Under this expanded definition, I considered six relevant non-financial definitions (satisfaction, control over one's destiny, enjoying what they do, having freedom, improved skills and creativity, and survival in business). Each of the non-financial component is clarified and supported by related and relevant literatures (chronologically arranged) where the defining moments of success were drawn out from that. Satisfaction, for instance has been considered by women entrepreneurs as success and it was illuminated and specified using a common theme from the literatures presented. As such, it may imply happiness, contentment, an inner feeling felt by the women entrepreneurs derived from providing goods or services to their customers and patrons. These

Implications and Future Directions

Women care less attention to profits, revenue, and the size of their venture in defining success (Carter, Gartner, Shaver, & Gatewood, 2003; Kepler, & Shane, 2007). As pointed out by Gomezelj and Kusce (2013), irrespective of its quantitative value, success impliedly means the fulfillment of previously established targets and objectives. The success of women entrepreneurs therefore, depends fundamentally on their specific characteristics and their entrepreneurial skills and abilities (Siba, 2019).

Due to the size of the venture that women micro-entrepreneurs managed, it is almost impossible to quantify their success and express such using financial terms and metrics. Besides, as these women micro-entrepreneurs perform dual or even multiple tasks and roles, the use of monetary terms to define success is less likely to be considered for the following reasons. First, women micro-entrepreneurs might be driven by the need to be independent and such will lead them to autonomy of making decisions as most women submit to their husbands especially for households where the husband's decisions mostly dominate. Second, micro-entrepreneurial activities afford women to find and discover their innate talents and such skills and abilities can be widely applied in their life as mother, woman, wife, and entrepreneur. Third, their micro venture has helped attain empowerment and gain their status in the society. Thus, there are moments which could be considered 'defining moments of success' that is far beyond the ability of financial and monetary indicators to expound and illustrate. Additionally, with the enormous degree of learning obtained, skills that were developed in their entrepreneurial journey, experiences that shaped them, and the empowerment attained is far beyond the bounds and limits that the word success can ever define.

However, I cannot discount the possibility of viewing this subject on the pragmatic point of view as most of the literatures considered in this article were under constructivist and post-positivist worldviews. Through the pragmatic view, a concept of pluralism may be applied and this can be the finest avenue to elucidate and dig deeper of defining success among women micro-entrepreneurs. In addition, a longitudinal and cross-cultural studies might be undertaken as the definition of success might be dependent on a specific culture, societal beliefs, and gender bias communities.

References

- Abdullah, F., Hamali, J., Rahman Deen, A., Saban, G., & Zainoren Abg Abdurahman, A. (2009). Developing a framework of success of Bumiputera entrepreneurs. *Journal of Enterprising Communities: People and Places in the Global Economy*, 3(1), 8-24.
- Adomako, S., Danso, A., Uddin, M., & Damoah, J. O. (2016). Entrepreneurs' optimism, cognitive style and persistence. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 22(1), 84-108.
- Ahmad, N., & Seet, P. S. (2006). Financial and non-financial indicators of business success: A study of Australian and Malaysian SME entrepreneurs. In *ANZAM Annual Conference, Rockhampton, Queensland*.
- Akhalwaya, A., & Havenga, W. (2012). The barriers that hinder the success of women entrepreneurs in Gauteng, South Africa. *OIDA International Journal of Sustainable Development*, 3(5), 11-28.
- Alam, S. S., Jani, M. F. M., & Omar, N. A. (2011). An empirical study of success factors of women entrepreneurs in southern region in Malaysia. *International Journal of Economics and Finance*, 3(2), 166.
- Ashraf, M. F., & Qureshi, T. M. (2010). Risk taking and essential success factors: A comparative analysis in 21st century entrepreneurial dimensions. *Mustang Journal of Business and Ethics*, 1, 99.
- Attar, M. R. H., & Jawale, S. R. (2012). *Women Entrepreneurs in India-Present Scenario*. Retrieved from <http://www.nevillewadia.com/images/Cronicle2012/Mr.-Riyazkhan-H.-Attar12.pdf>
- Ayobami, A. P., & Olakitan, O. O. (2011). An investigation of personality on entrepreneurial success. *Journal of Emerging Trends in Economics and Management Sciences*, 2(2), 95-103.
- Ayyagari, M., Demirguc-Kunt, A., & Maksimovic, V. (2011). *Small vs. young firms across the world: contribution to employment, job creation, and growth*. The World Bank.
- Bakri, A. M. M. (2012). *Developing Sustainable Growth Model for Women Entrepreneur in Malaysia: Case Study in Johor Bahru* (Doctoral dissertation, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia).
- Baruch, Y. (2006). Career development in organizations and beyond: Balancing traditional and contemporary viewpoints. *Human Resource Management Review*, 16(2), 125-138.
- Baumeister, R. F., & Leary, M. R. (1997). Writing narrative literature reviews. *Review of General Psychology*, 1(3), 311-320.
- Benz, M. (2009). Entrepreneurship as a non-profit-seeking activity. *International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal*, 5(1), 23-44.
- BMO Wealth Management Report (2016). *Are there gender differences among entrepreneurs?* Retrieved from https://wealth.bmoharris.com/media/resource_pdf/bmowi-gender-entrepreneurs.pdf
- Cader, H. A., & Leatherman, J. C. (2011). Small business survival and sample selection bias. *Small Business Economics*, 37(2), 155-165.
- Cardon, M. S., & Patel, P. C. (2015). Is stress worth it? Stress-related health and wealth trade-offs for entrepreneurs. *Applied Psychology*, 64(2), 379-420.
- Carter, N. M., Gartner, W. B., Shaver, K. G., & Gatewood, E. J. (2003). The career reasons of nascent entrepreneurs. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 18(1), 13-39.
- Carter, S., & Jones-Evans, D. (Eds.). (2006). *Enterprise and small business: Principles, practice and policy*. Pearson Education.
- Cassar, G., & H. Friedman. (2009). Does self-efficacy affect entrepreneurial investment? *Strategic Entrepreneurship Journal*, 3, 241-260.

- Chotkan, R. (2009). *Female entrepreneurship: Surinamese women acting entrepreneurial* (Master's thesis, University of Twente).
- Chotkan, R. (2009). *Female entrepreneurship: Surinamese women acting entrepreneurial* (Master's thesis, University of Twente).
- Dawson, C., de Meza, D., Henley, A., & Arabsheibani, G. R. (2014). Entrepreneurship: Cause and consequence of financial optimism. *Journal of Economics & Management Strategy*, 23(4), 717-742.
- Deci, E. L., & Ryan, R. M. (2011). Self-determination theory. *Handbook of Theories of Social Psychology*, 1(2), 416-433.
- Dej, D. (2010). Defining and measuring entrepreneurial success. *Entrepreneurship: A Psychological Approach*, 89-102.
- Deng, S., Wang, X., & Alon, I. (2010). Framework for female entrepreneurship in China. *International Journal of Business and Emerging Markets*, 3(1), 3-20.
- Dhillon, M. (2017). Challenges faced by women entrepreneur in India. *International Journal in Multidisciplinary and Academic Research*, 6(4).
- Din, H. (2007). *Islam: Effective referral of good manners*. Malaysia: PTS Litera Utama.
- Dougherty, D. D, Neubert, M., Griebel, J., & Park, J. (2013). A religious profile of American entrepreneurs. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 52, 104–109.
- Eib, C., & Siegert, S. (2019). Is female entrepreneurship only empowering for single women? Evidence from France and Germany. *Social Sciences*, 8(4), 128.
- Ettl, K., & Welter, F. (2012). Women entrepreneurs and success. In *Women's entrepreneurship and economics* (pp. 73-88). Springer, New York, NY.
- Fahed-Sreih, J., & Morin-Delerm, S. (2012). A Perspective on leadership in small businesses: Is the need for achievement a motive in predicting success? *International Journal of Entrepreneurship*, 16, 1.
- Fauchart, E., & Gruber, M. (2011). Darwinians, communitarians, and missionaries: The role of founder identity in entrepreneurship. *Academy of Management Journal*, 54(5), 935-957.
- Fisher, R., Maritz, A., & Lobo, A. 2014. Evaluating entrepreneurs' perception of success: Development of a measurement scale. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 20(5), 478-492.
- Gomezelj, D. O., & Kusce, I. (2013). The influence of personal and environmental factors on entrepreneurs' performance. *Kybernetes*, 42(6), 906–927.
- Gorgievski, M. J., Ascalon, M. E., & Stephan, U. (2011). Small business owners' success criteria, a values approach to personal differences. *Journal of Small Business Management*, 49(2), 207-232.
- Goyal, M., & Parkash, J. (2011). Women entrepreneurship in India-problems and prospects. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, 1(5) 132-137.
- Griebel, J. M., Park, J. Z., & Neubert, M. J. (2014). Faith and work: An exploratory study of religious entrepreneurs. *Religions*, 5(3), 780-800.
- Gupta, P., Guha, S., & Krishnaswami, S. (2013). Firm growth and its determinants. *Journal of Innovation and Entrepreneurship*, 2(1), 1-14. doi:10.1186/2192-5372- 2-15
- Hazlina Ahmad, N., Ramayah, T., Wilson, C., & Kummerow, L. (2010). Is entrepreneurial competency and business success relationship contingent upon business environment? A study of Malaysian SMEs. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 16(3), 182-203.
- Hmieleski, K. M., & Baron, R. A. (2009). "Entrepreneurs' optimism and new venture performance: A social cognitive perspective". *Academy of Management Journal*, 52(3), 473-488.

- International Labor Organization (2015). *Jobs, gender and small enterprises in Bangladesh*. Retrieved from <http://www.cartierwomensinitiative.com/docs/>
- Jayawarna, D., Rouse, J., & Kitching, J. (2013). Entrepreneur motivations and life course. *International Small Business Journal*, 31, 34-56. doi:10.1177/0266242611401444
- Justo, R., DeTienne, D. R., & Sieger, P. (2015). Failure or voluntary exit? Reassessing the female underperformance hypothesis. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 30(6), 775-792.
- Kepler, E., & Shane, S. (2007). *Are male and female entrepreneurs really that different?*. Washington, DC: Office of Advocacy, US Small Business Administration.
- Khalili, N., Qassas, N., & Barghouthi, S. (2018). Women Entrepreneurs in Palestine: Motivations, Challenges and Barriers.
- Kirkwood, J. (2016). How women and men business owners perceive success. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 22(5), 594-615.
- Klyver K., & Grant S. (2010). Gender differences in entrepreneurial networking and participation. *International Journal of Gender and Entrepreneurship*, 2(3), 213-227.
- Lai, K., Nathan, R., Tan, K., & Chan, B. (2010). Effect of Innovation to the Success of Female Entrepreneurs. *Journal of Innovation Management in Small and Medium Enterprise*, 1–14. <http://doi.org/10.5171/2010.369877>
- Lambert III, L., & Lambert, L. (2009). *Spirituality, Inc: Religion in the American Workplace*. New York: NYU Press.
- Lamine, W., Mian, S., & Fayolle, A. (2014). How do social skills enable nascent entrepreneurs to enact perseverance strategies in the face of challenges? A comparative case study of success and failure. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 20(6), 517-541.
- LeBlanc, A. A. (2013). *The effect of education and knowledge, experience, mentoring, and risk on the successful entrepreneur: A qualitative study* (Doctoral dissertation, Capella University).
- Lindsay, D. M., & Smith, B. C. (2010). Accounting by faith: The negotiated logic of elite evangelicals' workplace decision-making. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 78(3), 721-749.
- Lussier, R. N., Sonfield, M. C., Corman, J., & McKinney, M. (2001). Strategies used by small business entrepreneurs. *American Journal of Business*, 16(1), 29-38. doi:10.1108/19355181200100003
- Matharu, S. K. (2016). A Study on Motivational Factors that Affects the Success of Women Entrepreneurs. *Prestige e-Journal of Management and Research* 3(2).
- Makhbul, Z. M. & Hasun, F. M. (2011). Entrepreneurial Success: An Exploratory Study among Entrepreneurs. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 6(1), 116- 125.
- Matherly, T. A., & Goldsmith, R. E. (1985). The two faces of creativity. *Business Horizons*, 28(5), 8-11.
- Mboko, S., & Smith-Hunter, A. (2010). Zimbabwe women business owners: Survival strategies and implications for growth. *Journal of Applied Business & Economics*, 11(2).
- McGowan, P., Redeker, C. L., Cooper, S. Y., & Greenan, K. (2012). Female entrepreneurship and the management of business and domestic roles: Motivations, expectations and realities. *Entrepreneurship & Regional Development*, 24(1-2), 53-72.
- Millan, J.M., Hessels, J., Thurik, R., & Aguado, R. (2013). Determinants of job satisfaction: A European comparison of self-employed and paid employees. *Small Business Economics*, 40, 651–670.
- Miller, D. W., & Ewest, T. (2013). Rethinking the impact of religion on business values: Understanding its reemergence and measuring its manifestations. *Dimensions of teaching business ethics in Asia* (pp. 29-38). Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer

- Minarcine, S., & Shaw, C. (2016). Motivations for Entrepreneurship. *Journal of The Academic Business World*, 10(2), 47-56.
- Morris, M. H., Webb, J. W., Fu, J., & Singhal, S. (2013). A competency-based perspective on entrepreneurship education: Conceptual and empirical insights. *Journal of Small Business Management*, 51(3), 352–369. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jsbm.12023>
- Mustapha, M. (2016). Challenges and success factors of female entrepreneurs: Evidence from a developing country. *International Review of Management and Marketing*, 6(4S), 224-231.
- Nawaz, F. (2009). *Critical factors of women entrepreneurship development in rural Bangladesh*. Retrieved from <https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers>.
- Nieman, G., & Nieuwenhuizen, C. (2009). The nature and development of entrepreneurship: A South-African perspective. (2nd ed.). Pretoria, South-Africa: Van Schaik.
- Orser, B., & Dyke, L. (2009). The influence of gender and occupational-role on entrepreneurs' and corporate managers' success criteria. *Journal of Small Business and Entrepreneurship*, 22, 327-354.
- Parker, S. C. (2004). *The economics of self-employment and entrepreneurship*. Cambridge University Press.
- Parvin, L. Rahman, M. W. & Jia, J. (2012). Determinates of Women Microentrepreneurship Development: An Empirical Investigation in Rural Bangladesh. *International Journal of Economics and Finance*, 4(5), 254- 260.
- Penrose, E., & Penrose, E. T. (2009). *The theory of the growth of the firm*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Peris Bonet, F., Rueda Armengot, C., & Galindo Martín, M. Á. (2011). Entrepreneurial success and human resources. *International Journal of Manpower*, 32 (1), 68-80.
- Potgieter, I. (2012). The relationship between the self-esteem and employability attributes of postgraduate business management students. *SA Journal of Human Resource Management*, 10(2), 1-15.
- Powell, G. N., & Eddleston, K. A. (2013). Linking family-to-business enrichment and support to entrepreneurial success: Do female and male entrepreneurs experience different outcomes? *Journal of business venturing*, 28(2), 261-280.
- Price, L., Rae, D., & Cini, V. (2013). SME perceptions of and responses to the recession. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 20, 484-502. doi:10.1108/JSBED-04-2013-0057
- Pulubuhu, D. A. T., Sutinah, S., Wati, S., & Adhawaty, S. S. (2019). Strategies for women's empowerment in household industries in the province of South Sulawesi. *Review of Behavioral Aspect in Organizations and Society*, 1(2), 167-178.
- Rashid, K. M., Ngah, H. C., Mohamed, Z., & Mansor, N. (2015). *Success Factors Among Women Entrepreneur in Malaysia*, 1(2), 28–36.
- Rauch, A., & Frese, M. (2007). Let's put the person back into entrepreneurship research: A meta-analysis on the relationship between business owners' personality traits, business creation, and success. *European Journal of Work and Organizational Psychology*, 16(4), 353-383.
- Razmus, W., & Laguna, M. (2018). Dimensions of entrepreneurial success: A multilevel study on stakeholders of micro-enterprises. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 9, 791.
- Reavley, M. A., & Lituchy, T. R. (2008). Successful women entrepreneurs: A six-country analysis of self-reported determinants of success-more than just dollars and cents. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Small Business*, 5(3), 272.
- Reijonen, H., & Komppula, R. (2010). The adoption of market orientation in SMEs: Required capabilities and relation to success. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 18(1), 19-37.

- Rieger, K. (2012). *Phenomenological exploration of the characteristics of successful women entrepreneurs*. Northcentral University.
- Romelus, B. (2015). *5 Reasons Why People Become Entrepreneurs*. Retrieved from <https://www.business2community.com/small-business/5-reasons-why-people-become-entrepreneurs-01342462>
- Russell, M. L. (2013). The secret of leadership success. In *handbook of faith and spirituality in the workplace*. New York, NY: Springer.
- Sabrina, R. (2007). Micro finance, women, and patriarchy in Nepal: A critical analysis of women's economic rights. *Micro finance focus*, August 2007, Vol - 1, Issue - 12
- Sadi, M. A., & Al-Ghazali, B. M. (2012). *The dynamics of entrepreneurial motivation among women: A comparative study of businesswomen in Saudi Arabia and Bahrain*. New York, NY: Springer.
- Saleem, M. A. (2017). The impact of socio-economic factors on small business success. *Geografia-Malaysian Journal of Society and Space*, 8(1).
- Sarkis, J., Naser, K., Mohammed, W. R., & Nuseibeh, R. (2009). Factors that affect women entrepreneurs: evidence from an emerging economy. *International Journal of Organizational Analysis*.
- Schneider, K. (2017). Entrepreneurial competencies of women entrepreneurs of micro and small enterprises. *Science Journal of Education*, 5(6), 252-261.
- Shogren, K. A., Wehmeyer, M. L., & Burke, K. M. (2017). Self-determination. In *Handbook of positive psychology in intellectual and developmental disabilities* (pp. 49-64). Springer, Cham.
- Siba, E. (2019). *Empowering women entrepreneurs in developing countries: Why current programs fall short (Policy Brief)*. Retrieved from <https://think-asia.org/bitstream/handle/11540/9976/Empowering-women-entrepreneurs-in-developing-countries-190215.pdf?sequence=1>
- Siddaway, A. (2014). What is a systematic literature review and how do I do one. *University of Stirling*, 1, 1-13.
- Singh, R. (2012). Women entrepreneurship issues, challenges and empowerment through self-help groups: An overview of Himachal Pradesh. *International Journal of Democratic and Development Studies*, 1(1) 45-58.
- Solberg Nes, L., Evans, D. R., & Segerstrom, S. C. (2009). Optimism and college retention: Mediation by motivation, performance, and adjustment. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 39(8), 1887-1912.
- Solesvik, M., Iakovleva, T., & Trifilova, A. (2019). Motivation of female entrepreneurs: A cross-national study. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, 26(5), 684-705. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JSBED-10-2018-0306>
- Srivastava, S. (2012). Motivational Factors Instrumental in the Emergence of Women Entrepreneurship. *Aweshkar Research Journal*, 13(1).
- Storey, D. J. (2011). Optimism and chance: The elephants in the entrepreneurship room. *International Small Business Journal*, 29(4), 303-321.
- Taatila, V. P. (2010). Learning entrepreneurship in higher education. *Education and Training*, 52(1), 48-61
- Timmons, J., & Spinelli, S. (2009). *New venture creation, entrepreneurship for the 21st Century*. NY, USA: McGraw-Hill Higher Education.
- Van Praag, C. M. (2003). Business survival and success of young small business owners. *Small business economics*, 21(1), 1-17.

- Wach, D., Stephan, U., & Gorgievski, M. (2016). More than money: Developing an integrative multi-factorial measure of entrepreneurial success. *International Small Business Journal*, 34(8), 1098-1121.
- Walker, S. A. (2009). Reflections on leadership from the perspective of an African American woman of faith. *Advances in Developing Human Resources*, 11(5), 646–656.
- World Bank. (2014). *Labor force participation rate*. Retrieved from <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SL.TLF.CACT.FE.ZS>
- World Economic Forum. (2020). *Unleashing the power of Europe's women entrepreneurs: Six ideas to drive big change*. Retrieved from http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_Unleashing_the_power_of_Europes_women_entrepreneurs.pdf
- Xavier, S. R., Ahmad, S. Z., Nor, L. M., & Yusof, M. (2012). Women entrepreneurs: Making a change from employment to small and medium business ownership. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 4, 321-334.
- Yusof, S. M., Hameed, A. B., Tahir, R. M., & Othman, A. (2018). Hablumminallah among successful Muslim women entrepreneur: An exploratory study. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(5).
- Zhang, D., & Bruning, E. (2011). Personal characteristics and strategic orientation: Entrepreneurs in Canadian manufacturing companies. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*, 17(1), 82-103.